Asesorías y Iutorías para la Investigación Científica en la Educación Puig-Salabarría S.C.
José María Pino Suárez 400-2 esq a Berdo de Iejada. Joluca, Estado de México. 7223898475

RFC: ATI120618V12

Revista Dilemas Contemporáneos: Educación, Política v Valores.

http://www.dilemascontemporaneoseducacionpoliticayvalores.com/

Año: VI Número: Edición Especial Artículo no.:18 Período: Julio, 2019.

TÍTULO: El caso del asesinato de Benazir: encuesta literaria de las noticias e informe de investigación (de los años 2007 al 2008).

AUTORES:

- 1. Ph.D. stud. Sharjeel Naveed.
- 2. Lecturer. Huma Nisar.
- 3. Ph.D. Noreen Aleem.
- 4. Ph.D. stud. Syeda Maliha Begum.

RESUMEN: Se cree que los informes de investigación son la columna vertebral del Periodismo, trae la verdad en foco, detrás de la historia, y por lo tanto, los informes de investigación tienen gran importancia entre las masas. Este trabajo es realizado por un reporte de investigación. Los periodistas del Washington Post, Bob Woodward y Carl Bernstein escribieron la verdadera historia sobre "El escándalo de Watergate" y la renuncia forzada del presidente Richard Nixon. Se pueden introducir cambios positivos en la sociedad a través de dichos informes; por lo tanto, la cadena de tragedias inquisitivas como el asesinato de Liaquat Ali Khan, el ataque militar a Egipto desde Israel, el apoyo Pakistaní a Israel y el Reino Unido, el acuerdo de defensa con los EUA, la guerra con India, la guerra de 1971 y la separación de Pakistán Oriental y muchos otros, tuvieron lugar en la historia pero la gente de Pakistán nunca llegó a conocer la verdad, excepto los rumores y las noticias falsas.

2

PALABRAS CLAVES: reportes de investigación, Scotland Yard, General Pervez Musharraf,

Benazir Bhutto.

TITLE: The Benazir murder case: a literary survey of the investigative news and research report

(from years 2007 to 2008).

AUTHORS:

1. Ph.D. stud. Sharjeel Naveed.

2. Lecturer. Huma Nisar.

3. Ph.D. Noreen Aleem.

4. Ph.D. stud. Syeda Maliha Begum.

ABSTRACT: Investigative reporting is believed to be the backbone of journalism. It brings the truth

in focus, laying behind the story; therefore, investigative reporting holds great importance among the

masses. This job is done by the investigative reporter. Journalists of the Washington Post Mr. Bob

Woodward and Carl Bernstein wrote the true story about "Water Gate Scandal" and president Richard

Nixon's forced resignation. Positive changes can be brought into society through such reporting.

Therefore, the chain of inquisitive tragedies such as the murder of Liaquat Ali Khan, the military

attack on Egypt from Israel, Pakistani support to Israel and UK, defense agreement with the USA

1965 war with India, the war of 1971 and separation of East Pakistan, and many others took place in

the history but the people of Pakistan never got to know the truth except for rumors and fake news.

KEY WORDS: Investigative reporting, Scotland Yard, General Pervez Musharraf, Benazir Bhutto.

INTRODUCTION.

Investigative reporting is believed to be the backbone of journalism. Through investigative reporting,

all hidden facts about the crimes and malpractices like bank fraud, sexual harassment, kidnapping,

extortion, money laundering, bribery, judicial corruption, robberies, misuse of power and all such other scams can be obtained and brought to light by means of the research and the investigative reporting.

Investigative Reporters and Editors (IRE) is the world's largest non-profit investigative journalism association. It defines investigative journalism as "a systematic, extensive, and original research and reporting, often involving the unearthing of secrets, heavy use of public records, and computer-assisted reporting, with a focus on social justice and accountability" (IRE, 1983). However, in Pakistan, dozens of sorrowful events and shocking incidents have occurred. In this connection, various heads of the state, politicians and religious leaders have been assassinated. In this entire debacle the murder of Benazir Bhutto remained another grievous sight, therefore, this case was selected to examine the role of investigative reporting in introducing the concrete facts in the light, also to discover how much the public was satisfied with such efforts of journalism.

DEVELOPMENT.

Literature review.

Until now, there has been no research conducted on the issue of Benazir Bhutto's Assassination. This is going to be the first research conducted on the incident, although several books have been written describing her legacy and struggle for her political journey.

Katherine and Craig Doherty wrote a literary book on the first woman Prime Minister of Pakistan paying tribute to Benazir Bhutto. The book talks about all the ups and downs, life struggle and endurance that Benazir Bhutto had to face to keep up with her political journey. The writer also mentioned her 11 years exile and her return. Resuming her political career, she was warmly welcomed by the people of Pakistan and her party workers (Katherine & Craig, n.d).

Shakeel Anjum talks about the assassination of Benazir Bhutto in his book 'Who Assassinated Benazir Bhutto'. The book mainly talks about the hideous events that occurred in Benazir Bhutto's life consequently leading to her sad demise. In his book, Anjum detailed the controversies and conspiracies lying behind Benazir Bhutto's murder. The incidents like equivocation about the case of FIR against the then interior minister Rehman Malik, formation of Joint Investigation Team (JIT) and lodging of FIR against the murderers are part of this book.

The political journey of Benazir Bhutto has left a good deal of events to talk about. The sacrifices, the hardships she faced are the talk of the town. D. Javaid Laghari has laid down a collection of writeups by many national and international personalities including BB's daughter, son and husband paying their tribute to the unfathomable journey that Benazir Bhutto had gone through.

Objective of research.

The main purpose of this research is to find out the hidden facts about the assassination of Benazir Bhutto by analyzing the news items, published in the newspapers with the highest circulation across the country named as the daily Jang and daily Dawn. The paper will find out how much investigation these newspapers have done in the case and how many facts about the murder they have highlighted through their investigative reporting. Moreover, the paper will also signify the number of facts left untold.

Theoretical framework.

The theory pertaining to this research problem is presented as the Social Responsibility Theory of mass media. The theory clearly argues.

The press has a responsibility to the public. This theoretical approach is a result of broadcasting and media ethics. Early communication administrators such as Robert Hutchinson (head of the Commission on Freedom of the Press) expressed concern over communication ethics in libertarian

media cultures. Early followers of the theory believed that mass media should contribute to societal improvement. SRT has been widely recognized by media practitioners and scholars since the Commission on Freedom of the Press in 1947 (Yun, 2008).

The theory generally speaks about the fair dissemination of information and the investigation on the news. Journalism is considered as the courageous profession and the journalists are equally liable for the dangerous situations. Thusly, the responsibility of serving the society is equally viable for journalists.

Research methodology.

1. Content analysis.

The research is carried out by using content analysis research method. The researcher collected data from two English and Urdu newspaper. Whole data collection is based on investigative news reports published in Daily Jang Karachi and Daily Dawn Karachi during the time period from January 2007 to December 2008.

Using the qualitative content analysis as a research tool, the Qualitative content analysis is defined as, "A research method for the subjective interpretation of the content of text data through the systematic classification process of coding and identifying the meson patterns" (Hsieh & Shannon, 2005).

The researcher analyzed investigative news stories for the qualitative analysis. The articles of the same genre are published on the same day or around the same period in both newspapers were selected and analyzed. For the research purposes, the news items of 2007 and 2008 were focused. Benazir Bhutto was murdered on 27th November 2007, but the incident related news kept on appearing in the newspapers till 2008, especially in daily Jang and Daily Dawn. Therefore, many of the investigative news reports were included in this research paper.

The research findings are presented through tables indicating which newspaper published more investigative news of Benazir Bhutto's murder case investigation.

2. Background.

Benazir Bhutto holds the accolade of being the first female Prime Minister of the Muslim world, she had also been the prime minister twice in the past. Her government was dissolved on facing allegations of corruption in the past. Hoping to be the prime minister for the third time, she returned to Pakistan at Karachi Airport on 18th October 2007 after eight years self-exile. Benazir Bhutto (BB) with the help of foreign power succeeded to make a deal of National Reconciliation Ordinance (NRO) with Gen. Musharraf. Due to NRO, her cases were abolished and once more she became eligible to contest elections. Thousands of Pakistan People's Party's (PPP) protagonists gave her a warm welcome on her return to Pakistan. She arrived in the special bulletproof truck in procession (Jang, 2007). As per schedule, BB's grand procession was on its way to Mazar-e- Quaid. The precise moment BB's truck crossed the bridge at Karsaz a bomb exploded and killed at least 150 people on the spot and more than five hundred injured, luckily BB remained unhurt and survived the attack (Jang, 2007). On her return to Pakistan BB and Gen. Pervez Musharraf fiercely opposed each other on the reinstatement of the judge and other key issues. In this complex situation, the Gen. Pervez Musharraf promptly withdrew the security of BB and asked to arrange her security by herself. The PPP protested against the withdrawal of BB's security (Cheema, 2007).

During this time the general Elections were announced, and PPP decided to start their election campaign from Rawalpindi and an enormous crowd was gathered. After her speech BB returned to her vehicle, suddenly a bomb exploded, which later on was discovered as the suicide bomb blast to target Benazir Bhutto (Jang, 2007).

In the reaction of her murder the riots, fire, and a big turmoil spread throughout the country. Especially in Sindh, the situation remained horrible and uncontrollable till three. Hundreds of buildings cars and other property were burned, the government and public had to bear the economic losses of billions and billions of rupees. After her funeral, as per the will of BB, her son Bilawal Bhutto was announced as the new chairman of the party and until his education gets completed, Mr. Asif Ali Zardari was to function as Co-chairman of the PPP.

Findings and Discussion.

3. Daily Jang published Investigative news and analysis in brief. Investigative news published in Jang

Table 1.

Thrilling News	Investigative News	Total News
Nil-	51	51

It was evident that on reaching, Pakistan BB would be facing severe security threats. In an interview BB expressed her concern by saying, "when I will go back to Pakistan I feel I would have to face the situations like 12 May and I am worried about security measures, foreseeing the imminent danger from Baitullah Mehsud TTP leader I have asked for security from President House" (Jang, 2007). More than twenty politicians and various bureaucrats were the beneficiaries of NRO, on the other hand through NRO all the NAB cases from 1986 to 1999 were also going to be abolished (Cheema, 2007).

A news published in the newspaper says that as per NRO in future NAB, FIA or Police will not charge any case against PM, CM, MNA/MPA, it is also stated that the restriction on becoming the third time candidate for the Prime Minister will also be lifted, only to pave the way for BB to become Prime Minister in the future (Kalasra, 2007).

The newspaper also mentioned that in past BB have discussed very sensitive issues with USA such as to provide access to Osama Bin Ladin, Dr. Qadeer Khan and Lal Masjid Jihadis, this assurance to the USA became a security risk for BB (Cheema, 2007).

The newspaper published further news that before the arrival of BB in Pakistan the bulletproof vehicles could be imported, but BB had demanded the security equal to Gen. Musharraf (Chima, 2007).

Further, the newspaper wrote that because BB had stated to provide access to Osama Bin Ladin, Dr. Qadeer Khan and other secret matters, therefore, she had to face a very dangerous situation (Butt, 2007).

However, the Government in Pakistan expressed its concerns regarding the security measures taken for BB by herself, also that she has no idea about the number of enemies she made due to her disputed statements. Benazir Bhutto arrived on 18th October 2007 at Karachi Airport after the eight-year self-exile. She was welcomed by a hundred thousand workers. PPP showed the street power by this rally (Bukhari, 2007).

Despite all security measures, Benazir's truck was hit by a bomb blast, the security agencies searched for the clue to find out either this is a suicide attack or a planted bomb blast (Noorani, 2007).

An investigative report published in the newspaper says that PPP leaders protested against the Intelligence Bureau (IB) chief Ejaz Shah and blamed him for the whole failure. Asif Ali Zardari also pinned the blame on IB chief for being in contact with extremist groups using them for the blast (Mir, 2007).

However, the government of Pakistan refused the demands of IB Chief's removal by saying that country is facing terrorism and in this critical situation authorities are unable to remove IB chief because his services to eliminate terrorism are remarkable (Zafir, 2007).

In the next news, the newspaper published that BB did not only demand the removal of IB's chief but also sack the chief ministers of Sindh and Punjab provinces. BB thought that both chief ministers of Sindh and Punjab Arbab Rahim and Ch. Pervez Elahi respectively, are under the shadow of Gen. Pervez Musharraf and have no interest to provide security to her (Farooq, 2007).

The newspaper also mentioned that the President House issued a statement that the people around BB are spreading fake news. The Chief Minister of Punjab or Sindh and IB chairman Ejaz Shah were not involved in any vicious plan. To BB, the government had already offered the security equal to the president and Prime Minister, but she refused to take it, the authorities already warned them that the big procession and rally must be avoided, but the PPP administration remained incautious which resulted in the bomb blast (Abbasi, 2007).

In its next issue the newspaper claimed that on BB's demand for the removal of the three government officials, they must be investigated about Karsaz Blast. The IB chief should be suspended for inquiry. The government of Pakistan responded in denial (Abbasi, 2007).

In its next issue, a piece of news appeared in the newspaper regarding Benazir's demands to remove IB chief and Chief Ministers of two the provinces. The US secretary of state Condoleezza Rice rejected her request to put any pressure on the government of Pakistan (Zaidi, 2007).

On 27th December 2007, BB executed her first election rally from Rawalpindi at Liaquat Bagh. After her speech when she came back to her car, she stood up in her car's sunroof. Suddenly several shots were fired and a bomb blast subsequently. She was declared dead among other twenty-four people. The newspaper mentioned the Russian analyst's investigative report that BB was targeted by expert shooters as they fired six shots from three corners (NNI, 2007).

The newspaper published a viewpoint that the government issued strict instructions to the doctors of Rawalpindi General Hospital that they will not discuss the Benazir's last movements, body conditions and cause of her death, either if its blood loss or some other thing. The newspaper further added that

the record had been stolen from the hospital, immediately after the incident the whole crime scene was washed out cleaning all the true evidence, police never investigated from an eyewitness. Such acts of authorities were doubtful (WP, 2007).

In another issue the newspaper published the statement of the then-security adviser, Rehman Malik, that BB had already informed the government more than seventy times about her foolproof security for Pindy Rally, these all are the part of the record (Malik, 2008).

It evident through the history, from Liaquat Ali Khan to Benazir Bhutto Murder, in Pakistan every time a famous politician is murdered the Scotland Yard from the United Kingdom is called for the investigation (Jang, 2008).

The law experts say that as per British Law Scotland Yard is not allowed to investigate in another country (Jang, 2008).

The government called the Scotland Yard, but experts explained that as every clue has been washed away from the crime scene the chances of success are very low (Butt, 2008).

In its next issue, the newspaper published a report that the names of three PPP leaders and thirteen employees are put on ECL by the secret agencies (Jang, 2008).

The newspaper reported that the Scotland Yard started investigating BB's murder case. The video of the incident was provided to the search team, but there are no important clues available at the crime scene.

However, there were sharp differences of opinion between the PPP and government on BB's death cause. The government said she died of a skull fracture sustained when her head hit the sunroof of the vehicle; on the other hand, PPP leaders rejected this opinion and claimed that she died of the gunshots. Several eyewitnesses also said that BB died of the gunshots. An eyewitness endorsed that before the bomb explosion a fire was shot towards the vehicle, but the authorities insist that she died because of the skull fracture (AFP, 2008).

The Scotland Yard experts complained about the dearth of material provided by the authorities to investigate the case. Consequently, they are not hopeful for solving the case (Jang, 2008).

In the next issue, the paper mentioned that Jihadis were also trying to attack the rallies in Lodhran and Muzaffargarh but they could not succeed (Ahmed, 2008).

It was also indicated by the British High Commission that the Scotland Yard experts were not allowed to search the cause of death and about the mastermind of the plan (Chima, 2008).

The newspaper also published another aspect that for the murder of Benazir Bhutto the services of extremist group were hired, it is also proven through some secret documents that the attackers were well trained. Killers took special training to not to miss their target. In this respect, some invisible hands were also helping them (Anjum, 2008).

According to Scotland Yard's investigation report, Baitullah Mehsud is responsible for the murder of BB, she was targeted by a laser gun and the killers were supported by the establishment (Kalasra, 2007).

The assassination of Benazir Bhutto led the country to the billions of losses (Khalil, 2008).

Mr. Asif Ali Zardari has written a letter to United Nation regarding his wife's murder, but the British government refused to help him (Kalasra, 2008).

In another issue, the newspaper published that Benazir Bhutto died due to head injuries (Khalil, 2008). The newspaper further indicates that Scotland Yard prepared the report in many weeks while the Pakistani investigative officials would have done it within a few hours. The Scotland Yard's reports were not up to the mark and their researched statements were full of contradictions (Abbasi, 2008). The newspaper also mentioned that on one hand Baitullah Mehsud was blamed for Benazir Bhutto's

The newspaper also mentioned that on one hand Baitullah Mensud was blamed for Benazir Bhutto's murder but on the other hand Baitullah Mahsud sent a delegation to Bilawal house for condolence to Asif Ali Zardari (Mir, 2008).

In the next issue, the newspaper reported that a suspect was arrested in Kamra in BB murder case namely Abdul Rasheed who later admitted about providing the weapons for the murder, he is also charged in another case of rocket launcher fire (AFP, 2008).

The news came out that government has taken a decision to call UNO team for investigation (Akhlaq, 2008).

In another issue, the newspaper reported that after the investigation of Scotland Yard's team the government will send a letter to the Secretary-General of UNO requesting them to send a team to investigate the BB's murder case (Miyan, 2008).

The news appeared that the government took the prompt action to request UNO for investigation and the Foreign Minister Shah Mehmood Qureshi will soon visit the USA (Zafar, 2008).

The newspaper also wrote that after studying all records of this case UNO agreed to form a commission for investigation (Miyan, 2008).

In the next issue, the news appeared that because the whole crime scene was washed, all shreds of evidence were lost, and this situation led the United Nation's experts to nowhere in the investigation (Abbasi, 2008).

In a news report, the paper disclosed that if United Nation's team will investigate BB's case they would need to spend 1400 million rupees (Kalasra, 2008).

The newspaper also disclosed that during the PPP's government, all the police officers were warned to keep silent in BB's case investigation (Abbasi, 2008).

In the next issue, the newspaper published that if United Nation accepts this case for the investigation, they may nominate Indian or Israeli investigators to solve this case and various stakeholders in Islamabad would not accept it (Abbasi, 2008).

In another issue, the newspaper published that just after the murder of BB her bodyguard Khalid Shahanshah was killed, according to the news report this was a big loss to solve this riddle because Khalid was commissioned for the security of BB, it is said that his murder should also be investigated (Noorani, 2008).

A news report said that government once again decided to hand over the case to United Nation's experts for investigation (Zafir, 2008).

A news report appeared that United Nation experts need a huge amount of four hundred million dollars for further investigation (Zafir, 2008).

In the next issue, the newspaper disclosed that the situation was the same, even after one year of PPP's government no further progress was made to solve BB's murder case. The workers were depressed and most of them believed that it is a pity if even after becoming a ruling party PPP cannot solve the case, afterwards, we cannot demand other governments to provide justice nor any other government will take interest to solve the case (Butt, 2008).

A news report claims that the workers of PPP think perhaps the president and PPP government have no confidence on secret agencies, therefore, the government is willing to hand over this case to the United Nation investigation team (Zafir, 2008).

In its next issue, the paper published that PPP government is unable to decide how to hand over this case to the investigation team of UN. However, the PPP leaders are looking forward to the investigation through United Nation agencies (Miyan, 2008).

The newspaper published that on the first death anniversary of BB, Mr. Asif Ali Zardari announced that he knows the killers of Benazir Bhutto. Now the workers and other political parties are demanding Asif Ali Zardari to disclose their names as now it is his duty (Aqdas, 2008).

4. Investigative News Published in daily Dawn – a brief analysis.

Table 2.

Thrilling News	Investigative News	Total News
-	27	27

On 18th October 2007, the former Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto returned to Pakistan. Generally, people were very much concerned about the imminent chaos and terrorism in the country. In its current issue, The Daily Dawn published that a few leaders of PPP thought that their leader's life is in danger (Ghosi, 2007).

To give her warm welcome, PPP's workers pasted banners around the city; the Chief Minister Arbab Rahim issued an order to remove all banners from the hoardings but police officer refused to do so. On this matter, the difference of opinion could be seen between the Sindh government and the Sindh Police (Ayub, 2007).

In its next issue, the newspaper published that when BB showed up outside the airport thousands of workers came to welcome her in a form of a rally. The rally was en route from Shahra-e-Faisal to the tomb of Quaid. When rally reached near Karsaz Bridge, a bomb exploded. The police vehicles around got burnt of the blast, BB was in a bulletproof vehicle, therefore, she was safe. A detailed report was published including the views of people injured in the blast (Hassan and Ayub, 2007).

In the next issue, a news report appeared that PPP spent 300 million rupees on reception rally (Afshan, 2007).

The news published in another issue that more than one thousand vehicles were hired on rent. Eight to twenty thousand rupees were spent on the rally procession, for further matters party spent a lot of money. The news said that all important roads were closed for the traffic and hence many other injured from the bomb blast failed to reach the hospitals (Siddiqui and Alam, 2007).

In its next issue, the news story appeared that the US President George. W. Bush and his administration believed that an agreement between BB and Gen. Pervez Musharraf is necessary for the benefit of Pakistan. For this concordance, the USA played an important role (Hyder, 2007).

In another issue, the newspaper mentioned that Rawalpindi is the city where Zulfikar Ali Bhutto, the father of BB was hanged, hence BB is willing to start her election campaign from the same city. The party workers agreed to the decision (Asghar, 2007).

The newspaper published Benazir Bhutto's postmortem report on 27th December and discussed important clues. The story highlighted another aspect of the murder that both father and daughter died in the same city. A heartfelt reaction came all across the country. Therefore, the newspaper published the editorial on the front-page paying tribute to BB on her remarkable struggle for democracy and prosperity of Pakistan (Muhammad, Munawar, and Azeem, 2007).

In this respect, the newspaper published a whole page coverage including Benazir's photos, views, and news of the people from different cities paying tribute to her (Dawn, 2007).

The newspaper revealed the reaction of the people from all across the country regarding BB's murder. It also mentioned that the government failed to control the anarchic situation in the country (Dawn, 2007).

In another issue, the newspaper published news that due to BB's murder the Election Commission announced the extension in the date for General Elections (Ayub, 2007).

The newspaper published a report of Los Angeles Times about the Bush administration had already informed BB that extremists are active in Pakistan and they are planning to target her, and she could have been killed, therefore, she must pay attention to her security (Dawn, 2007).

Another news appeared in the newspaper that BB wanted to show her concern for the P.M. L (N)'s workers who were shot when an armed man opened fire at them, in this connection Benazir Bhutto wanted to contact Mian Nawaz Sharif, but unfortunately, she herself became a martyr (Akhlaq, 2007).

Further news appeared about Baitullah Mehsud, saying that he is the main planner behind the murder of BB, the question now arises that who is Baitullah and how did he become a companion of Al-Qaida Group (Khan, 2007).

Another aspect revealed by the newspaper that, Benazir Bhutto sent a message to Washington that she cannot continue the deal between her and Gen. Pervez Musharraf due to his non-cooperative attitude, the deal had been finalized by the USA. Actually, she believes that Gen Musharraf is in full control of President Bush (WP, 2007).

The newspaper published that the Pakistani government did not agree to let this case investigated by foreign agencies (Raza, 2007).

Another issue of the newspaper revealed that after the incident government's high officials secretly accessed the postmortem report and strictly warned the Doctors not to say a word about the postmortem report (WP, 2007).

A news item also appeared that Scotland Yard's Team reached to Islamabad to probe the murder case (Raza and Asghar, 2007).

During the investigation, the Scotland Yard's investigators asked for the belongings of Benazir Bhutto which were in the custody of Pakistan Police. The police provided everything except for her shoes (Asghar, 2008).

Another news item indicates that the postmortem was very important, but the doctors were helpless because her husband Mr. Asif Ali Zardari was in Dubai and till his arrival postmortem cannot be done (Syed, 2008).

Meanwhile, the other news items stated that Asif Ali Zardari didn't allow for the postmortem, while doctors were also in pressure of secret authorities. This situation made it more difficult to discover the reason for death (Asghar, 2008).

After the sad event, the paper revealed that the minute BB's death was declared, riots erupted in Sindh especially in Karachi. The city was caught in a nightmare situation, from 27 to 31st December, within just three days violence and arson spread across the city, malicious burning of cars, buses, band robberies, car, and mobile snatching, bank robberies and incidents of kidnapping took place rapidly. All the figures were published in the newspapers. Karachi had no writ of government in those three days (Ayub, 2008).

The newspaper source revealed that the criminal already arrested in BB's murder case told to the police that his next target was American Consulate, but the police caught him in time (Dawn, 2008).

CONCLUSIONS.

Benazir Bhutto's family is the one who had been in the government three times. Her three family members were killed during the Martial Law of General Zia-ul-Haq. First of all, her father, the former Prime Minister and founder of Pakistan People's Party Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto was hanged by a judicial decision in Rawalpindi Jail on 21st April 1979. After 6 years in 1985, Benazir Bhutto's Younger Brother was poisoned then ten years later in 1996 her elder brother was shot dead in Clifton, Karachi. Ten years later Benazir Bhutto returned to Pakistan ending her self-exile on 18th Oct 2007. She was killed in Rawalpindi Liaquat Bagh during an election campaign rally on 27th December 2007. Earlier, on 18th Oct 2007, Benazir Bhutto survived a bomb attack at Karsaz in Karachi.

The daily Jang and daily Dawn both newspapers published especial news items, photos and a brief history of Benazir Bhutto's life and her family. The investigative reports of both newspapers gave an in-depth insight of what happened in the past of Benazir including the present situation with imminent danger and several predictions about the different angles of incidents that might take place after Benazir's arrival during all the processions and rallies.

Both the newspapers published the details about the post-murder situation and the unsolved mysteries about the disappearance of the postmortem report from the hospital. Doctors were threatened to keep their mouths shut and were strictly warned about not to discuss regarding her death cause. Both the newspapers published detailed analysis on the death of Benazir Bhutto.

Daily Jang and daily Dawn published various reports in which it was revealed that police arrested a Taliban activist who was involved in the murder, later on, he accepted his crime. As a matter of fact, the PPP workers and leaders thought that behind the curtain a few very powerful personalities are involved in BB's murder. Another fact that Asif Ali Zardari stayed as President of the country for five years and yet he did not succeed in arresting the killers.

Daily Jang and Dawn also published the international perspective of Benazir's death which states that Gen. Pervez Musharraf and establishment's policy is against extremism. Since the last ten years, the murder case of Benazir Bhutto was on trial in Rawalpindi anti-terrorist court, yet the case was unsolved. At last the anti-terrorism court of Rawalpindi on 13th August 2017, declared five men convicted for Benazir Bhutto's murder. After their trial, they were set free but another two police officers the former DIG police Saud Aziz and SP Khurram Shahzad were found guilty for being careless on their duty. The court announced punishment of 17 years imprisonment for each including a penalty of five hundred thousand rupees for both criminals. At this time Gen. Pervez Musharraf was out of country and court announced him an absconder.

The daily Jang and dawn published very informative news about the Benazir murder case, despite all facts and information the court freed the five accused on account of having no proof against them even after they had accepted their crime. Then two police officers were punished for their careless attitude towards their duty.

Obviously, there are certain questions unanswered, the case in trial never gave out the answers. Neither any reporter discussed this matter, nor any senior army officer talked about it. The disturbing news came out about the lawyer who was dealing with BB's murder case was also murdered. Daily Jang on 29th December 2007 published that Gen. Pervez Musharraf and few elements within the establishment might have been in touch with the Taliban for the killing. This might be possible that they had planned the murder together. However, despite all the open facts, no one could find the mastermind of this tragic incident.

Recommendations.

The research suggests some recommendations on the part of news reports. Despite both newspapers published a wide range of analytic news stories, the newspapers should also concentrate on transparent and unbiased reporting. The news reports should be devoid of any slant towards any of the opposition or the ruling party.

The investigative reporting serves the masses hence the facts presented by the investigative reports should be brought to light with full transparency.

BIBLIOGRAPHIC REFERENCES.

- 1. Aalam, M. (2007, October 19). PPP Chief's home Coming brings a stand still. *Daily Dawn* [Karachi], p. 17.
- 2. Abbasi, A. (2007, October 22). US government pressure to Pakistan government: to remove Director of I.B, Daily Jang Karachi [Karachi], p. 1.
- 3. Abbasi, A. (2008, July 16). According to experts Pakistan will not take help to solve Benazir case through United Nation. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 4. Abbasi, A. (2008, February 9). Benazir murder case concluded by Pakistani secret agencies within hours while the British has taken wee to do so. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.

- 5. Abbasi, A. (2008, July 17). In Benazir case, the government of Pakistan, pressurize the concerned official to keep silent. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p.1
- 6. Abbasi, A. (2008, July 18). United Nation will be independent to select the investigation team to investigate the Benazir case-, *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 7. Abbasi, A. (2007, October 20). President's spokesman said Benazir unaware of the facts, her blame on three personalities is worthless. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 8. AFP. (2008, February 16). During the murder of Benazir a culprit was arrested and he admitted that he has supplied arms. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 9. AFP. (2008, January 5). Contradictory statements and proofs have vanished in this situation Scotland Yard unable to submit any report. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 10. Anjum. S. (2008). Who Assassinated Benazir Bhutto. Retrieved from www.bhutto.org
- 11. Ahmed, A. (2008, January 6). At Lodhran and Muzaffargarh terrorist were chasing Benazir Procession. Daily Jang [Karachi], p. 1.
- 12. Ahmed, A., Asghar, M., & Azeem, M. (2007, December 28). PPP loyalists let loose indignations. *Daily Dawn* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 13. Akhlaq, Q. (2008, June 5). For investigation of Benazir murder case, an application will be handed over to UNO tomorrow. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 14. Anjum, S. (2008, January 7). For the murder of Benazir Bhutto expertise of terrorists has been hired. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 15. Aqadus, F. (2008, December 31). News comes out that murders have been discovered the PPP followers and other political group were anxious to know the names. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 16. Asghar, M. (2008, January 6). Detective inspects assassination site. *Daily Dawn* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 17. Asghar, R. (2007, December 27). Bhutto hanging site withers city astir for Benazir's rally. *Daily Dawn* [Karachi], p. 16.

- 18. Asghar, R., & Asghar, M. (2007, December 28). Garhi Khuda Bux awaits another Bhutto. *Daily Dawn* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 19. Ayoub, I. (2007, October 18). The row over PPP hoarding police incurs Arbab's era. *Daily Dawn* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 20. Ayub, A. (2008, January 6). Gangsters had a free hand during riots. Daily Dawn [Karachi], p. 1.
- Ayub, I. (2007, December 28). Stunned Karachi descends into anarchy. *Daily Dawn* [Karachi],
 p. 17.
- 22. Butt, T. (2007, October 13). Dangerous threats are much more than Benazir's imaginations, *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 23. Butt, T. (2008, December 26). On slow investigation process and governments less interest in this regard the PPP followers were felt grievously and sorrowful, *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 24. Butt, T. (2008, January 5th). The Scotland Yard will not be permitted to investigate with nominated persons *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 25. Calssra, R. (2008, January 18). In Benazir murder case the British Government will not support to UN investigation. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p
- 26. Cheema, U. (2007, October 9). It was announced that bulletproof vehicle delivered before arrived of Benazir Bhutto Daily *Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 27. Cheema, U. (2007, October 8). After threats from Baitullah Mahsood Benazir asked for her security from President House. *Daily Dawn* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 28. Cheema, U. (2007, October 10). Benazir Bhutto asked the Musharraf government to provide security equal to President. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 29. Cheema, U. (2007, October 5). Various bureaucrats and twenty politicians will be beneficiaries from NRO-. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.

- 30. Cheema, U. (2008, January 7). British High Commission disclosed that the British investigation team does not allow the reasons after her death. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 31. Clasra, R. (2008, July 16). Pakistan governments have spent one billion and four million rupees for UN investigation- . *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 32. Derek Forbes, D. (2005). A watchdog's guide to investigative reporting [pdf]. Retrieved from http://www.msu.ac.zw/elearning/material/1503861021Investigative%20Journalism%20Ebook.p
- 33. Doherty. K, Doherty. C. (n.d). Benazir Bhutto. Retrieved from www.bhutto.org
- 34. Farooqi, J. (2007, October 20). Benazir Bhutto asked the government to remove of Punjab and Sindh chief minister. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 35. Ghosi, S. U. (2007, October 17). Benazir's return evokes and apprehensions. *Daily Dawn* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 36. Haider, M. (2007, October 21). Bush Administration having second thoughts about-PPP deal: NY. *Daily Dawn* [Karachi], p. 16.
- 37. Hassan, R., Ayoub, I., & Al-Rahman, S. (2007, October 19). Benazir Survives midnight carnage. *Daily Dawn* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 38. Hsieh, H.-F., & Shannon, S.E. (2005). Three approaches to qualitative content analysis. Qualitative Health Research, 15(9), 1277-1288.
- 39. Ikhalaq, Q. (2007, December 31). Benazir wanted to call Nawaz Sharif minutes before the assassination. *Daily Dawn* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 40. Iqbal, N. (2007, December 30). EC hints at putting off the poll. *Daily Dawn* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 41. Investigative Reporters & Editors. (1983). the reporter's handbook. New York: St. Martin's Press.

- 42. Jamsheed, B. (2007, October 14). Very costly arrangements being done for reception of Benazir Bhutto at Karachi. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 43. Jang News. (2008, January 4). In experts opinion, that investigation of United Nation is not an alternative to Scotland Yard. Daily Jang [Karachi], p. 1.
- 44. Jang News. (2008, January 4). On any political murder in Pakistan demands comes forward that call the Scotland Yard for investigative- . *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 45. Kalasra, R. (2007, October 16). In NRO just like politicians, Army and judiciary also like a holy cow *Daily Dawn* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 46. Khalil, T. (2008, February 6). Benazir's cause of death was her head injury. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 47. Khalil, T. (2008, January 16). National Research Commission has been prepared the comprehension report of Liaquat Bagh Tragic Incident-. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 48. Khan, I. (2007, December 31). Baitullah Mehsud, Pakistan's biggest at Lammas. *Daily Dawn* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 49. Klasra, R. (2008, January 14). Bait Ullah Mehsood is responsible for Benazir Murder, British investigation report. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 50. Laghari. J. (2008). Reflections on Benazir Bhutto. Karachi. SZABIST.
- 51. Mir, H. (2007, October 20). Why PPP believe I.B. chief was mastermind of this murder. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 52. Mir, H. (2008, February 15). A delegation of Bait Ullah Mehsood will visit Bilawal House for condolence with Mr. Zardari. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 53. Miyan, A. (2008, June 7). A letter for Benazir murder's case sent to Secretary General of UNO. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.

- 54. Miyan, A. M. (2008, July 12). United Nation agreed to form a Commission to investigate Benazir Case. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 55. Miyan, A. M. (2008, December 27). United Nation possibly investigates Benazir case from next month. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 56. NNI. (2007, December 31). A Russian soldier claimed that a team of well-trained shooters killed Benazir Bhutto. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 24.
- 57. Noorni, M. A. (2008, July 23). The murder of Khalid Shahinsha was a great upset for Benazir murder case, *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 58. Norani, A. (2007, October 20). The bomb disposes at Shahra Faisal become a riddle for government to prove it a suicide bombing. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 59. Raza, S. I. (2008, January 2). Govt not ready for Murder Probe by foreign experts. *Daily Dawn* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 60. Raza, S. I., & Asghar, M. (2008, January 5). Scat land yard experts meet local detective. *Daily Dawn* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 61. Reporter, S. (2008, January 5). Benazir Murder case being an investigation by Scotland yard team and they have received videotape from the government agencies *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1
- 62. Reports, D. (2007, December 29). Mob rule Paralyeses State machinery. *Daily Dawn* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 63. Reports, D. (2007, December 28). Tumultuous life, tragic end. Daily Dawn [Karachi], p. 14.
- 64. Reports, D. (2007, December 30). US warned BB weeks before fatal attack report. *Daily Dawn* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 65. Reports, D. (2008, February 13). Musharraf did nothing for my protection. *Daily Dawn* [Karachi], p. 1.

- 66. Reports, J. (2007, September 17). Benazir said that on my arrival there may be a situation of the 12th May. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 67. Reports, S. (2008, January 5). Three political leaders and two activists' names included in ECL. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 68. Syed, B. S. (2008, January 6). Medical report fraught with lacunae, experts. *Daily Dawn* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 69. Washington Post. (2008, January 1). Benazir distanced herself from the deal. Daily Dawn [Karachi], p. 1.
- 70. Washington Post. (2008, January 2). Medical records removed decor, silenced, report. Daily Dawn [Karachi], p. 3.
- 71. Washington Post. (2008, January 2). Doctor was pressurized to keep silence and do not discuss the causes of death of Benazir. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 72. Washington Post. (2008, January 2). The government pressuring to doctor to keep silent and do not discuss the causes of death of Benazir Bhutto *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 73. Yun, H. (2008). Social Responsibility Theory. In L. L. Kaid & C. Holtz-Bacha (Eds.), Encyclopedia of political communication (1)749-749. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications, Inc. doi: 10.4135/9781412953993.n630
- 74. Yaqoob, M. (2008, January 3). For security measures, we have given 71 applications to government Rahman Malik says Daily Jang [Karachi], p. 1.
- 75. Yaqoob, M. (2008, January 3). Rahman Malik told it that PPP has sent 71 letters to the government for security concern of Benazir Bhutto. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 76. Zafir, S. (2007, October 20). Government have no intension to remove DG, (I.B). Daily Jang [Karachi], p. 1.

- 77. Zafir, S. (2008, July 1). Regarding the investigation of Benazir murder case government insist to UN team for speedy process. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 78. Zafir, S. (2008, September 7). The murder of Khalid Shahinsha upset the whole investigation process. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 79. Zafir, S. (2008, September 7). It is announced that matter of Benazir Case will be more highlights in United Nation- . Daily Jang [Karachi], p. 1.
- 80. Zafir, S. (2008, September 28). Expenses of Benazir case investigation about 400 million dollars UNO should bear. Daily Jang [Karachi], p. 1.
- 81. Zafir, S. (December 27). Investigation process of Benazir murder case could not decide between the UNO and Pakistani concern authorities. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 82. Zahid N. (2007, October 13). There are more dangers and threats to Benazir's life as she thinks (2007, October 13). Daily Jang [Karachi], p. 1.
- 83. Zaidi, N. (2007, October 29). Secret agencies, provincial administration, and US government rejected the application of Benazir Bhutto. *Daily Jang* [Karachi], p. 1.
- 84. Zafir, S. (2007, October 20). The government says there is no any proposal to remove Director General of I.B. Daily Jang [Karachi], p. 1.
- 85. Zaidi, N. (2007, October 29). Secret agencies; provincial authorities and US government reject the application of Benazir Bhutto. Daily Jang [Karachi], p. 1.

DATA OF THE AUTHORS.

- Sharjeel Naveed. Ph.D scholar, Federal Urdu University Karachi, Pakistan.
 Email: Sharjeelnaveed@gmail.com
- 2. Huma Nisar. Lecturer, Federal Urdu University, Karachi, Pakistan. Email: humawarisk@gmail.com

- **3. Noreen Aleem.** Ph.D. and Assistant Professor, University of Karachi, Pakistan. Email: Noreen.aleem@yahoo.com
- **4. Syeda Maliha Begum.** PhD Scholar, Federal Urdu University for Arts and Sciences Karachi, Pakistan. Email: malihasyed345@gmail.com

RECIBIDO: 3 de junio del 2019. **APROBADO:** 17 de junio del 2019.