

Año: VINúmero: Edición EspecialArtículo no.:13Período: Agosto, 2019

TÍTULO: Un análisis del papel de la lengua nativa como fuente facilitadora en la enseñanza de la segunda lengua.

AUTORES:

- 1. Ph.D. Noreen Saba.
- 2. Ph.D. Mamuna Ghani.

RESUMEN: Esta investigación enfatiza la importancia de preservar L1 mientras se enseña L2 y ver qué papel importante desempeñan las creencias de los maestros en este sentido. Se diseñó un cuestionario y entrevista de carácter estructurado y semiestructurado. La población fue cien maestros seleccionados al azar que trabajaban en las escuelas de inglés prominentes de Multán. Se utilizó el método experimental con dos grupos de 5^a clase (30 estudiantes). Se encontró que el uso limitado y juicioso del idioma nativo al enseñar L2 en las aulas fue realmente útil. Los datos fueron evaluados con tablas estadísticas y tabulación. La conclusion determina sugerencias para mejorar el escenario de aprendizaje de una segunda lengua para las instituciones pakistaníes. El artículo incluye recomendaciones para profesores, autoridades y padres.

PALABRAS CLAVES: preservar L1 mientras se enseña L2, escuelas medianas de inglés de Multán, método experimental, instituciones educativas pakistaníes.

TITLE: An analysis of the role of native language as a facilitating source in the teaching of Second Language.

AUTHORS:

- 1. Ph.D. Noreen Saba.
- 2. Ph.D. Mamuna Ghani.

ABSTRACT: This research emphasizes the importance of preserving L1 while teaching L2 and to see what important role the beliefs of teachers play in this regard. A questionnaire and interview of structured and semi structured nature was designed. The target population was one hundred teachers randomly selected working at the prominent English medium schools of Multan. Experimental method was used with two different groups 5th class (30 students). It was found that the limited and judicious use of native languages while teaching L2 in the classrooms was really helpful. The data was evaluated with statistical charts and tabulation. The conclusion consisted of suggestions to make the scenario of second language learning better for Pakistani institutions. The article includes recommendations for teachers, authorities and parents.

KEY WORDS: preserving L1 while teaching L2, English medium schools of Multan, experimental method, Pakistani educational institutions.

INTRODUCTION.

Like many other countries in the world, Pakistan is also a multi-lingual country. With regard to our titled field of study poses many questions in the context of teachers' beliefs in preserving L1 while teaching L2.

When we talk about a particular region i.e. the district Multan, Pakistan, it reveals that Siraiki is very much popular medium of communication in general in the focused division. Definitely, there is

Punjabi, and of course, there is Urdu as well. Having observed the above said realities, Urdu being our national language conspicuously comes forward as the most common medium of communication amongst the societal fabric residing there; therefore, at least one fact is established that the teachers coming from that particular society are pre-dominantly very well Urdu oriented. Consequently, though Urdu occupies the place of L1.

Now, in support of our view, we would like to mention a survey report that we conducted at our own i.e. hundred questionnaires were distributed to this effect, out of which 90% teachers came up with the result that L1 should be the basic medium of communication at early school level in just a position with that L2 should be taught from alpha to omega as a subject in its widest sense but primarily let the students should understand and assimilate their values, taboos, traditions and customs in L1. While studying L2 as a subject which may at a stage will positively enable them to transform themselves from L1 to L2 rather than to perplex the students with L2 at a very early stage.

When we talk about education for all, at primary level, many factors get involved into it and language, no doubt, is one important factor of them to understand and communicate in classroom. Many countries of the world are multilingual, yet they allow only one language to dominate the education sector.

Kangas (2000) describes submersion in the following words "Instruction through a language that learners do not speak has been called Submersion because it is analogous to holding learners under water without teaching them how to swim" (p.263-265).

In Pakistan, along with many other difficulties such as lack of facilities at schools, flickering standards, poorly designed curricula, teachers who are not motivated, financial problems and submergence makes it really difficult both for the teachers and the taught especially when the target language (L2) is also foreign for the teachers. One aspect of this study was to define relationship between the bilinguals L1 and L2. In order to improve the learning process at school level, a

considerable number of scholars and educationists are working to find out the correlation between a person's L1 and L2.

We know appropriate language instructions, in the field of education, are very important as they increase students' access and improve quality of education. Some of the well-known educators believe that the goal of education is only achieved in those countries where the medium of instruction is mother tongue. It was quite appropriate to study teachers' beliefs and attitudes towards English language learners (ELLs) with regard to the importance of L1 because teachers' beliefs and attitudes affect the way they behave and guide their students, which can, in turn, motivate students toward learning a second language successfully. Language teachers in Pakistan have been facing a number of problems and have some challenging questions such as:

i) How can English language be taught in a perfect way?

ii) Does teaching English means we are neglecting the role of L1 (Urdu in Pakistani context)

iii) Is it possible to teach all new concepts without using L1?

iv) Does the use of L1 mar the learning of L2?

The researchers believe that one way to deal with these issues is to probe into teacher's own beliefs regarding the use and role of L1 in teaching English (L2) in their professional lives and in their society. As we know, teachers play a crucial role in the delivery of language instructions and also play a significant role for motivating their students to learn, it is, therefore, essential that they should be aware of the beliefs that they are working upon. Through this awareness, we can guide teachers and head-teachers to review their beliefs and practices whether they are worth maintaining or not.

Objective of the Study.

The objective of the study was to investigate that the use of L1 does not reduce the communicative ability of the students rather it facilitates them. It was also the objective of the study to make more and

more professionals realize the importance of the use of L1 in the classroom.

Research Questions.

The research aimed to find out teachers' beliefs about the use of L1 and how far these beliefs are practiced in the classroom.

Language Acquisition.

It is a process of attaining the capability to understand, produce and use sentences of a language. It usually refers to first language L1 that a child learns.

Second Language Acquisition.

Second language acquisition is also known as SLA. The second language or languages are other than the learner's "native language" or mother tongue. They may, in a literal sense, be the second language the learner is working with or they may be his third, fourth or fifth language.

Learning a second language is a sub-discipline of applied linguistics. Most of the second language learning is associated with the internal representation of the language as working in the mind of the learner and how these representations are changed with the phases of time. Any ways, it has not yet been possible to inspect these representations directly with the help of brain scans or using similar techniques. Therefore, SLA researchers has to depend on the inferences drawn from the learners' speech or writing.

Mother tongue/ Native Language/L1.

The first language of a speaker is called L1 or Mother Tongue (Native language). All these terms are interchangeable. It is just breathed in from the atmosphere. The learner learns without much deliberate effort. The concept of mother tongue or L1 is not as simple as it is in other parts of the world when compared with the ethnic, socio-cultural linguistic panorama of South east-Asia. Stern H. H. (1983) points out that these terms may refer either to the language acquired first in infancy, or to

a language which was acquired later but has come to be the dominant one(p:67-80). Skutnabb Kangas (1981) defines the first language as the language one thinks in and the language one dreams(p:117-125).

Importance of English Language.

English language is the language of science, commerce, trade, engineering, banking and aviation. It is almost found in all fields of life in almost all countries of the world. It is a rich language having a vast lexicon on all aspect of human life. English Language is the language of most of the researches conducted world over in different branches of knowledge. English is the biggest language of the world. It is spoken and understood in almost all parts of the world. English as a Killer Language. It is estimated that life began on this planet earth about 5-10 million years ago, but we do not know exactly when languages were invented. Although all these societies used some or the other languages. To quote Rehman (1998) "In prehistoric times, there existed 10 thousand to15 thousand languages. We still have more than 6 thousand languages, but we are losing them day by day. Even in Pakistan "Badeshi "language is dead and "Ushojo" is about to die, still some are weakened. There may be

some languages which are on the way of extinction, but reports are not showing.

To explain what "language death" is we can say that when the last speaker of a language dies and this also happens when speakers of that particular language start using some other language. This is also called language shift. It is believed that people do not shift their mother tongue, but it has happened in history. It may happen when some people's language is looked down upon and faces some contempt. In such cases people start using the prestigious languages which are used in Education system, commerce and respectable company in order to gain respect, jobs and prestige. So, we can say that languages do not die they are willfully killed. It can also be viewed as "language suicide" as the learner himself wishes to learn some other language to empower himself/herself. So is the case in Pakistan, that we are learning English at the cost of our own local language or languages. Such

languages which put pressure on other languages are called "Killer languages" and English is one such language (94-95).

Status and Importance of English language in Pakistan.

About the status of English language in Pakistan, keeping in view the past 67 years of Pakistan and its colonial past, it can be said that the status of English language in Pakistan had been a controversial topic over the years.

All the constitutions of 1956, 1962 and 1973 articulated the desire to replace English language gradually for all practical purposes. Still today, we maintain English language as the most popular second language. It is the language of government, business, law, technology, research and of higher education. Heavy investments are made on the training of teachers to teach English language properly (How far are these effort s fruitful? It is another question).

Meeting the local conditions how English can be taught effectively using modern accepted methods is the core question for all training programmes. With public perception that English is basic requirement for white collar jobs, the demand for English language is increasing. It is also noted that English is taught through immersion in Pakistan, in private schools, the most successful student of the elite schools' main jobs. Therefore, the present study focused and tried to find out the reasons behind unsuccessful English learners that why they could not acquire the said proficiencies to enter the mainstream of progress in Pakistan.

We still have more than 6 thousand languages, but we are losing them day by day. Even in Pakistan "Badeshi "language is dead and "Ushojo" is about to die, still some are weakened. There may be some languages which are on the way of extinction, but reports are not showing.

To explain what "language death" is we can say that when the last speaker of a language dies and this also happens when speakers of that particular language start using some other language. This is also called language shift. It is believed that people do not shift their mother tongue, but it has happened in

7

history. It may happen when some people's language is looked down upon and faces some contempt. In such cases people start using the prestigious languages which are used in Education system, commerce and respectable company in order to gain respect, jobs and prestige. So, we can say that languages do not die they are willfully killed. It can also be viewed as "language suicide" as the learner himself wishes to learn some other language to empower himself/herself. So is the case in Pakistan, that we are learning English at the cost of our own local language or languages. Such languages which put pressure on other languages are called "Killer languages" and English is one such language.

English Language in Pedagogy.

Pedagogy means the way used by the teachers to impart specialized knowledge. The skilled language teachers use such pedagogy in the classroom which not only makes the students comfortable in language learning but also enhances their confidence.

Watkins and Mortimer (1999) have defined pedagogy in these words 'any conscious activity by one person designed to enhance the learning of another' (3:1999). Alexander (2003) has his own preferred definition which suggests that pedagogy requires discourse: Pedagogy is the act of teaching together with its attendant discourse. It is what one needs to know, and the skills one needs to command in order to make and justify the many different kinds of decisions of which teaching is constituted Role of Teachers in Teaching a Foreign/ Second Language.

Language teachers are the real role models to follow for all the learners. For the desired learning outcomes of the students the role of the language teachers is very significant. It is required that the teacher must come with a suitable strategy and approach so that the learning goals are achieved. He must plan the activities according to the difficulty level i-e from easy to difficult and then proceed from difficult to more or most difficult things.

The Concept of Teachers' Beliefs in Teaching English.

A belief is a state of mind or a set of habits during which confidence is placed in some person or thing. In other words, we can say that a belief is a notion or tenet kept by a group of people. Dilts (1999) defines beliefs as "evaluations that people make about others and about the world around" (Dilts, 1999) but it is not as simple as the definition seems to put forward because it includes a complex psychological process underneath (159).

Pajares (1992) provides the following words and phrases which are anonymous with beliefs: 'attitudes, values, judgments, axioms, opinions, ideology, perceptions, conceptions, conceptual system, preconceptions, dispositions, implicit, theories, personal theories, internal mental processes, action strategies, rules of practice, practical principles, perspectives, repertories of understandings, and social strategy, to name but a few that can be found in the literature" (Pajares 1992:309); furthermore, he suggests the following synthesis of beliefs drawn from his review of the literature on the topic:

- 1. Beliefs are formed early. In fact, the earlier a belief is incorporated into the belief structure, the more difficult it is to alter. Newly acquired beliefs are almost vulnerable to change.
- Beliefs appear to be self-perpetuated and resistant to change. They tend to preserve even against contradictions by reason, time, schooling or experience. In addition, individuals tend to hold onto beliefs based on incorrect or incomplete knowledge even after scientifically correct explanations are presented to them.
- 3. People develop a belief system that houses all the beliefs acquired through the process of cultural transmission.
- 4. Beliefs play a key role in defining tasks and selecting the cognitive tools with which to interpret, plan, and make decisions regarding such tasks. Therefore, they play a critical role in defining behavior and organizing knowledge and information (1992:10).

9

Pajares (1992) goes on to quote Murphy (2000) teachers come to the classroom with their own system of beliefs and, to some extent, these determine many of the choices they make in relation to what and how they teach. According to her "teachers' belief are a complex and inter-related system of personal and professional knowledge that serves as implicit theories and cognitive maps for experiencing and responding to reality. Beliefs rely on cognitive and effective components and are often tacitly held" (1992:10).

Beliefs represent a person's choice rather than an accepted fact. The attitudes of teachers come forward as they think about the language that they use in teaching. Luckily or unluckily, their attitudes play a crucial role in language's "growth or decay, restoration or destruction" (Baker, 1988). Nugrapemy T. Zachri (2003) in his survey of tertiary teacher's beliefs points out following five sources of teacher's beliefs:

- 1. Teacher's own experience as language learners.
- 2. Experience they gained from teaching.
- 3. Teacher's personality.
- 4. Teachers expectation from parents, school, the local community and the government.
- 5. Education-based or research-based principles (20-25).

Gardner and Lambert's contribution in explaining the Process of SLA.

Both, these linguistics were working in collaboration in early sixties and their contribution in explaining the relationship of attitudes in teaching and learning process of SLA cannot be ignored in any way (Eliss, 1985).Gardener discussed the linguistic and non-linguistic variables in the process of language learning in his models. He continued improving his models of SLA from 1979, 1985 and 2001 on the basis of his empirical studies.

The fundamental model discusses two primary individuals' differences variables i.e. ability and motivation. Gardner's social-educational model presented us with four variables namely social milieu, individual differences, second language acquisition context and outcomes. All these four variables are interlinked in second language learning. The first variable that is social milieu is definitely linked with the learner's cultural beliefs and environment which in turn effects the individual differences.



Fig. 1. A Schematic representation of Gardner's (1985) Socio-educational Model of SLA.

English at Primary level "Not in My Classroom": Teacher attitude towards English language learning in the Mainstream classroom by Dr. Anne Walker, Dr. Jill Shafer, & Dr. Michalle Limas at the University of North Dakota. This paper points out that the teachers who possess raciest or negative attitudes or who believe in any of the numerous fallacies around education system fail to meet the social and academic needs of the students (130-132).Virginia P. Colliar and Wayne P. Thomas (2004) at George Mason University in their paper "The Astounding effectiveness of Dual language Education for all" published in (NABE Journal of Research and Practices, Vol. 2 number1, Winter 2004 NJRP) have asserted that use of L1 is only way to fill the academic gaps in L2 learning. Stauart A. Karabenik and Phyllis A-Clemas Nodaat Eastern Michigan University in their research entitled, "Professional development implications of teacher's beliefs and attitudes toward English language Learners", wrote that ELL students should be tested in their L1 rather than L2, they also put forward that lack of fluency in L2 does not imply students' poor understanding power.

Arguments in Support of L1.

The present discussion about the importance of L1 springs from the growing perception that L1 is not prohibited in most recent modern teaching methods as it was looked down upon or disregarded in past (COOK, 2011b). He maintains the view in his paper: The Interplay between Universal Grammar, Universal and Linage Specificity (p: 10-12) that use of L1 is getting its due importance because of latest research. Therefore, some of the L2 researches focus on the potential that L1 may offer.

Researchers have documented the importance of both L1 and L2 in language learning functions and this concept echoes back in the theories proposed by earlier linguists and scientists such as Harold Palmer in the year 1964. Turnbull (2001) in the 'Canadian Modern Language Review, 54 (4) under the title "There is a Role for the L1 in Second and Foreign Language Teaching, but......." points out the importance of L1 as supporting tool in L2 classes. Levine (2003) in his report of a questionnaire study under the title 'Students and Instructors Beliefs and Attitudes about Target Language Use, and Anxiety', in Modern Language Journal 87 (3) 345-365 states the importance of the use of L1 in classroom.

Atkinson (1987) in his paper titled as 'The Mother Tongue in Classroom: A Neglected Resource' for E.L.T. Journal 41(4) 240-25 is of the view that a powerful resource which can be helpful in many ways is neglected only because it is available in the form of mother tongue.

As early as the late 19th century a famous philologist Sweet recognizes the value of native language in acquiring a second or foreign language. Sweet (1964) put forward that language instruction must "begin with knowledge of one's own language. The first preparation for the study of a foreign language is the acquisition of a thorough knowledge of the peculiarities of one's own language" (193:1964). Kuenzi (2008) quotes Palmer on the importance of using one's mother tongue in these words "Perfectly harmless and in many cases positively beneficial" (19:2008). Auerbach (1993) also points out the importance of giving instructions in L1 in her studies of adult English as a second language (ESL). He asserts that in this way students feel secured and they express themselves better as supposed to a situation where instructions are only delivered in L2 (167-177:1993).

How a Balance can be Kept between L1 and L2.

In their combined effort towards the publication of a paper: Why a bilingual approach to education is a necessary change for English learners'' Hach, Hedrick, Henson and Jones says in favour of bilingual education that bilingual instruction must be the goals in order to fulfill the requirements of our majority language students be provided the opportunity to reach their full potential for a nation that embrace diversity (P: 15).

Carole Bensons' paper: The importance of mother tongue-based schooling for educational quality (2004), prepared for UNESCO says (p:15) that a seriously adapted investment of time and resources, along with a commitment to collaborate with community members is required to prepare materials for bilingual programs by linguists and educators . He further adds that a weak form results in a weaker state of affairs as countries which are economically weak often attempt to translation to the L2 after only one or two years, without consolidating literacy in L1 or communicating skills in L2 . Shortcuts" are tried to do too much too quickly that result in no special advantage. Carole Benson says that researchers from multilingual contexts report more than two languages into picture, for instance, Pattananayak. D.P (2003) in his paper 'Language Issues in literacy and Basic Education: The Case of India. "Towards a Multilingual culture Of Education" describes the situation in India that has a trilingual school policy that involves a regional (State)

language a national language (Hindi) and along with an international one (English) (p: 16-17).

Kangas (2000) has noticed that one strong form of bilingual schooling that has to be applied is the developmental maintenance or heritage language model whose sole purpose is bilingualism or bi-literacy framed on long term development of L1 and L2 skills (187-190:2000).

A recent study by Hoven (2002) in Niger that examined bilingual and non-bilingual students both in L1 and L2 clearly demonstrated that the learners who did their best were bilingual students tested in the L1, while learners who did least well were those non-bilingual students tested in the L2. (91-97:2002). Many European countries researchers suggest that a language foreign to the learner should be taught as a subject for five or seven years prior to teach academic content this would mean focusing on primary schooling and using appropriate methodology to teach other languages as subjects.

Misconception about Bilingualism.

Some people believe that there is hardly any room in a learner's mind for more than one language, but if we look around the world, we find many children learning two, three or more languages making no harm to their academic development. There is no support found to the idea that two languages confuse people rather it is evident that well developed bilingualism enhances one's "cognitive flexibility" (Hakut 1986: 56-58)."Not in My Classroom": Teacher attitude towards English language learning in the Mainstream classroom by Dr. Anne Walker, Dr. Jill Shafer, & Dr. Michalle Limas at the University of North Dakota. This paper points (p:130-132) out that the teachers who possess raciest or negative attitudes or who believe in any of the numerous fallacies around education system fail to meet the social and academic needs of the students. Albert & Obler (1978) opine that there is no guarantee that we learn a language being exposed to the input unless we understand it.

Latest Language Policy in Pakistan.

According to Rahman (1999) in Pakistan language policy aims at promoting Urdu language for strengthening national unity. Urdu language actually is the binding force for all the provinces. In the four provinces of Pakistan there is no legislation made except in Sindh for the promotion of and preservation for regional or local languages. According to the latest educational language policy (2009) in Pakistan, English would be the medium of instruction at all educational institutions including primary level. This actually is an alarming situation for teachers, parents and students. Actually, in Pakistan, there is a little attention paid to the education of all (20-21).

Why is it important to preserve Language Diversity?

It is the domain of preventive linguistics, i.e. the branch of linguistic s which will help us to prevent the depth of languages. One can ask, "Should we save languages from becoming extinct at all?" After all, there is a view that having many languages is costly and inconvenient. One has to learn them, and translations costs a lot of money. Besides, one needs reading material, teachers and jobs in these languages; otherwise they could not be learned. Rahman (2010:174) quotes David Crystal that the later has given the following five major reasons for preserving the linguistic diversity of the world.

- 1. We need diversity.
- 2. Languages express identity.
- 3. Languages are depositories of knowledge.
- 4. Languages contribute to the sum of human knowledge.
- 5. Languages are interesting in themselves. (Crystal 2000: 27-67).

Methodology.

The researcher used qualitative as well as quantitative methods for the study as unstructured and

semi-structured interviews along with structured questions were used to collect data from teachers. The target population was teachers working at prominent English medium school of Multan Division. One hundred teachers were randomly selected and given the questionnaire and twenty-five teachers interviewed to which they responded in written form. The study also included twenty-five students of class v at a prominent English medium school of Multan.

Books, journals, newspaper, magazines (available on the topic sited above) and instead were used as research tools. It was descriptive as well as experimental field-based study carried out with the help of:

a) Questionnaire.

b) Interviews (un- structured and semi-structured).

c) Achievement tests.

While choosing the data collection tools research traditions for similar studies were kept in mind. The process of sampling was carefully done in a systematic way. The universe for the study was definite and real as it included the male and female students and teachers studying and working at English medium schools. The age group for teachers was varied from 25-55 years and for students it was 10-12 years. Following are some of the questions from questionnaire represented in graphical mode.

Question no.1.

One major reason of our lacking in fulfilling the academic goals is the fear of English Language.

Feedback.

39% teachers strongly agreed.

22% teachers slightly agreed.

31 % teachers agreed.

0.5% teachers disagreed.

0.3% teachers strongly disagreed.

Analysis.

The data suggests that majority of the teachers under study i.e. 92% opine that the reason of our lacking in fulfilling the academic goals is the fear of English Language. It suggests the idea that the students instead of focusing on the concepts conveyed through language are focusing more on the fear of language and its understanding.



Question no.2.

I am in favour of a judicious use of L1 in the classroom for its potential and preservation.

Feedback.

80% teachers strongly agreed.

0.8% teachers slightly agreed.

0.2% teachers agreed.

0.5% teachers disagreed

0.5% teachers strongly disagreed.

Analysis.

A high percentage of teachers is found to be in favour of a judicious use of L1 in SL learning class which shows that teachers are well aware of the benefits of the use of L1 but due to the prevalent school policy they try to avoid the use of L1.



Question 3.

All the critical faculties of students are not fully developed because some concepts they do not understand in English language.

Feedback.

32% teachers strongly agreed.

- 14% teachers slightly agreed.
- 37% teachers agreed.

07% teachers disagreed

10% teachers strongly disagreed.

Analysis.

83% teachers replied that all the critical faculties of students are not fully developed because some concepts they do not understand in English language.



Question no.4.

The use of L1 in classroom is harmless, and in many cases, positively beneficial.

Feedback.

20% teachers strongly agreed.

18% teachers slightly agreed.

50% teachers agreed.

0.4% teachers disagreed.

0.8% teachers strongly disagreed.

Analysis.

88% subjects agreed to the idea that the use of L1 in classroom is harmless, and in many cases, positively beneficial which gives rise to the myth that Urdu language cannot fulfill the requirements of modern times.



Question no.5

Well planned bi-lingual syllabi should be introduced.

Feedback.

55% teachers strongly agreed.

0.8% teachers slightly agreed.

30% teachers agreed.

No one disagreed.

0.7% teachers strongly disagreed

Analysis.

93% of the respondents considered the fact that there should be a well-planned bi-lingual concept that arises from the high number of percentages in support of well-planned bi-lingual syllabi is that





CONCLUSIONS.

The study revealed that although the role of the use of L1 in English classroom is small yet; it is extremely important while communicating meaning and content.

The study indicated those parts of language concepts where use of L1 is important. At primary level, however this use of L1 is far more important as it was noticed that in many classroom situations teachers feel the need of the use of L1 while teaching synonyms, types of sentences and active and passive speech in particular.

Use of L1 in the classroom is also necessary when some students feel hesitate while speaking English, so in such cases, teacher should encourage the learner in his mother tongue and then gradually proceed towards English language.

BIBLIOGRAPHIC REFERENCES.

- Albert, O. (1978). The Bilingual Brain: Neuropsychological and Neurolinguistic Aspects of Bilingualism. Academic press. New York.
- Atkinson. D. (1987). The Mother Tongue in classroom: A Neglected Resource. Retrieved from E.L.T. Journal, 41(4)
- 3. Auerbach, E. (1993). Reexamining English only in the ESL classroom.
- 4. Auerbach, E (1993). Literary language and its public in late Latin antiquity and in the middle ages. Prinston University Press. Germany
- Baker, C. (2001). Foundations of Bilingual Education and Billingualism. Third edition. Clevedon. Multilingual Matters. Bristol. UK
- Brown, H. D. (2000). Principles of language learning and teaching. Fourth edition. White plains. Pearson Education. New York.
- Brown, H. D. (2001). Teaching by principles: An interactive approach to language pedagogy. (2nd ed.). Pearson Education. New York.
- Chomsky, N. (2003). On Language. Chomsky's Classic Works. Retrieved from Language and Responsibilitity and Reflections on Language in one Volume. The New Press. New York.
- Clyne, M. (2003). Towards a more language-Centered. Approach to Pluriligualism. Cambridge University Press. Cambridge.
- Dewaele, J. M., Housen, A., & Wei, Li. (eds.) (2003). Bilingualism: beyond basic principles. Oxford University Press. London.
- 11. Collier (1995). Promoting academic success for ESL students: Understanding second language acquisition for school. Noorwood. New Jersey.
- Cook, V. (2001). Using the first language in classroom. Retrieved from The Canadian Modern Language Review, 57 (3).

- 13. Crystal, D. (2001). The Cambridge Encyclopedia of English Language. BCA. Toronto.
- Cummins, J. (1984). Bilingualism and special education: issues in assessment and pedagogy. Retrieved from Clevedon, Multilingual Matters.
- 15. Gibson, M. A. (1998). Promoting academic success among immigrant students: Is acculturation the issue? Retrieved from Educational Policy, 12 (6).
- Hakuta (1986). Mirror of language: The debate on bilingualism. Retrieved from New York: (Review by Genesee 1987. in Minami and Kennedy 1991).
- Heath, S. B. (1986). Sociocultural contexts of language development. In Beyond Language: Social and cultural factors in schooling language minority students. Oxford University Press. London
- Hitotuzi, N. (2006). The learner's mother tongue in the L2 learning-teaching symbiosis. Retrieved from PROFILE, 7.
- Hovens, M. (2002). Bilingual Education in West Africa: Does it work? Retrieved from International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bililingualism 5:5.
- Jhonston, B. (2003) Values in English Language Teaching. Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Publishers. London
- Kangas, T. (2000). Linguistic Genocide in Education- or Worldwide Diversity and Human Rights? Mahwah: Lawrence Erlbaum Publisher. New Jersey, USA.
- 22. Kramsch (1997). "The privilege of the non-native speaker." Retrieved from Modern Language Association of America 112:
- 23. Krashen (1981). Second language acquisition and second language learning. Pergamon. Oxford.
- Kuenzi, J. J. (2008). CRS Report for Congress- Science, Technology, Engineering, and Mathematics (STEM) Retrieved from Education: Background, Federal Policy and Legislative Action. Congressional Service.

- 25. Levine, G. S. (2003). Student and instructor beliefs and attitudes about target language use, first language use, and anxiety: report of a questionnaire study. Retrieved from The Modern Language Journal,87.
- 26. Lincoln and Guba (1985). Naturalistic inquiry. Sage. California.
- Lo Bianco (1999). "Policy words: talking bilingual education and ESL into English literacy." Retrieved from Prospect 14 (2).
- Lvovich (1997). The multilingual self: an inquiry into language learning. Lawrence Erlbaum. New Jersey.
- 29. Mattioli, G. (2004). On native language and intrusion making do with words. Retrieved from The English Teaching Forum, 42.
- Mustafa, Z. (2011). The Tyranny of language in Education. Ushba Publishing International. Karachi. Pakistan.
- 31. Palmer. H.E. (1965). The Principles of Language study. Oxford University Press. London
- 32. Pattanayak, D. (2003). Language issues in Literacy and basic education: The case of India. In Ouane, A. (ed). Pavlenko (2001). Retrieved from "Language learning memoirs as a gendered genre." Applied Linguistics 22 (2):
- Rehman, T. (2010). Linguistics for Beginners -Basic Concept. Oxford University Press. Karachi. Pakistan.
- Rehman, T. (2011). From Hindi to Urdu A social and political history. Oxford University Press. Karachi. Pakistan.
- Rehman, T. (2010). A study of Education, inequality and polarization in Pakistan. . Karachi.
 Pakistan
- 36. Ricento, T. (2006). An Introduction to Language Policy: Theory and Method. Blackwell publishing. Malden. USA.

- Schweers, W. Jr. (1999). Using L1 in the L2 classroom. Retrieved from English Teaching Forum, 37 (2),
- Siddiqui Shahid. (2012). Education, Inequalities, And Freedom. Narrative publishers. Lahore, Pakistan.
- Kangas, S. (2000). Linguistic Human Rights and Teachers of English. The Central European University Press, New Jersey.
- 40. Sweet, H. (1964). The Practical study of languages. Oxford University Press. London.
- 41. Walker, A., Shafer, J. & Liams, M. (2004) "Not in my Classroom": Teacher Attitudes Towards English Language Learners in the mainstream Classroom. Retrieved from NABE Journal of Research and Practice, 2:1.
- Woods, D. (1996). Teacher cognition in language teaching. Cambridge. Cambridge University Press.
- 43. Zubeida, M. (2011) Tyranny Of Languages In Education. Ushba Publishers International. Karachi.

DATA OF THE AUTHORS.

- 1. Noreen Saba. Visiting Lecturer in English, National Textile University Faisalabad, Pakistan. She is a PhD Candidate at The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan.
- 2. **Mamuna Ghani.** Incharge, Faculty of Arts/Director, Advanced Studies and Research Board, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan. Correspondence: meemash504@gmail.com

RECIBIDO: 3 de julio del 2019. **APROBADO:** 15 de julio del 2019.